



BOOK REVIEWS

Tres grandes cuestiones de la Historia de Iberoamérica: Derecho y justicia en la historia de Iberoamérica; Afroamérica, la tercera raíz; Impacto en América de la expulsión de los Jesuitas. José Andrés-Gallego, coordinator. (Madrid: **Fundación Ignacio Larramendi/ Fundación Mapfre Tavera**, 2005. Pp. 220 (con 51 monografías en Cd-rom). N.p. Hardback.)

Some of the most solid academic research that emerged from the Columbian anniversary of 1992 was sponsored by the MAPFRE Foundation of Spain and directed by José Andrés-Gallego of the Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas. Some 250 books by some 330 academics in forty countries were printed focusing on a wide variety of topics related to the infamous year, 1492. The various collections sponsored by the foundation not only treated subjects related to the New World, but also to the expulsion of the Arab and Jewish communities from the Iberian peninsula.

The present work seeks to address three lacunae in the MAPFRE collections: the history of Spanish laws in the Americas, slavery and the contributions of Africans to the New World, and the suppression of the Society of Jesus from Spanish domains in 1767. It does so in the innovative way of presenting a printed volume with a CD-Rom. The book contains three historiographical essays by Andrés-Gallego that primarily raise issues for further research while partially summarizing the state of the question in each of these topics. Accompanying this book is a CD-Rom with some 51 monographs, of varying quality and employing a variety of methodologies from the human sciences, broaching different aspects of the three subjects mentioned above. Remarkably, the digital documents in PDF-format, approximate 15,810 pages of text. The scope and breadth of the CD-Rom, particularly the various bibliographies included, make this MAPFRE TAVERA and Ignacio Larramendi Foundations publication one of the most complete sources of information on these three topics, and a must-have reference tool for any scholar working in these fields or educational institutions interested in Latin America.

The historiographical essay on the history of Spanish laws in America is somewhat rambling and convoluted. More than offering a synthetic review of the state of the question, it highlights areas for further research in the form of a litany of interdisciplinary questions. The continuity and discontinuity between colonial legal traditions and those of the independent Latin American nations is highlighted as an issue to be investigated. It seems clear from the ample archival evidence of legal actions initiated by Amerindians or on their behalf demanding satisfaction for the non-enforcement of the crown's laws protecting them that these were not carried out satisfactorily. Yet an aspect of this issue that remains to be investigated is whether the Amerindians fared better under colonial or republican justice.

Among the seventeen monographs in the CD-Rom dealing with the history of the king's laws in the New World the following are particularly ground-breaking studies:

Carlos Lázaro Avila, "La diplomacia de las fronteras indias en América." This is a study of a little-known juridical institution of the New World, the *parlamentos*. These were meetings between the crown's authorities and the leadership of Amerindian peoples not under Spanish control in frontier territory, and culminating in international treaties between the two. 256pp.

Javier Barrientos, "La Real Audiencia de Santiago de Chile (1605-1817): La institución y sus hombres." This is a comprehensive study of the principal Spanish court in Chile. It exhaustively examines the nature of the *audiencia* and the judges and other personnel who ran it, down to the royal privileges they enjoyed, whom they married, and the content of their last wills and testaments. 794pp.

Arno and Maria José Wehling, "Direito e Justiça no Brasil colonial: O tribunal da relação do Rio de Janeiro 1751 e 1808." The authors study how the law was applied in colonial Brazil by thoroughly studying the juridical and organizational aspects of Rio's principal court, as well as the type of sentences it handed down. 318pp.

Alejandro Guzmán, "Historia de las codificaciones en Iberoamérica." The first time that a single work presents the history of how the law was codified throughout colonial Latin America. 395pp.

In the second section of this book Andrés-Gallego reviews the contribution that Africans have made to Spanish America. He begins by noting the differences in Hispanophone and Anglophone scholarship on the issue of slavery. Following the lead of Eric Williams and Frank Tannenbaum's scholarship from the 1940's, scholars have tended either to see slavery as an economic institution that later became a racist phenomena, Williams' perspective, or identified different types of slavery in North America and South

America, Tannenbaum's view. According to the latter, slavery in Spanish and Portuguese America was more paternalistic and less cruel than slavery in the United States due to different understandings about the nature and right of slaves, that originate in Roman law. Andrés-Gallego suggests that the difference for the divergent views concerning the cruelty of slavery among scholars of North and South America may be due to the scarcity of documents of the kind found in South America that gave slaves all sorts of privileges not enjoyed in the North, for example, the frequency with which slaves have their complaints heard before the Crown's justice in Spanish and Portuguese America. Be that as it may, Andrés-Gallego cautions that a worthy judgment about the relative cruelty of slavery in the Americas will emerge if scholars are attentive to microhistory. By microhistory he means examining individual cases to determine whether the laws of the realm that seem to suggest more rights for slaves in Spanish and Portuguese America were in practice actually carried out. So for example, the severe penalties mandated by Spanish law against escaped slaves should not be compared with similar legislation in the United States until one determines whether such legislation was actually carried out and with what degree of violence. He cites that while such legislation was draconian, in practice, it was often not enforced because slave owners were concerned that slaves would be crippled by such harsh penalties, and that this would decrease their profitability, already compromised by their escape.

However, attention to individual cases raises the question of how representative these documented cases were of what was actually occurring. If documented cases of slave maltreatment were few, as happens in Spanish and Portuguese America in comparison with North America, are those cases representative of a larger cohort of similar occurrences which were never documented, or is it the case that the cases of slave abuse in Latin America were fewer than those in the United States? Andrés-Gallego's answer, which he presents as applicable to other unresolved dichotomies in colonial history, is a "constant dialectic between macro and microhistory" (p. 124), even if he does not address how to adjudicate between divergent interpretations produced by scholars employing such a dialectic.

The CD-Rom gathers some twenty digital documents related to the presence of Africans in the New World. The following in particular deserve special mention:

Ulrich Fleischmann, "Black culture, white discourse and creole history: a study on interpretations of American slavery." This historiographical essay examines the divergent interpretations that exist about slavery in the Western hemisphere, and how the ideological presuppositions of most authors has produced a body of scholarship that is, unfortunately, highly subjective. 153pp.

Sheila do Castro Faria, "Cotidiano dos negros no Brasil escravista." This is a detailed reconstruction of the daily life of slaves in Brazil based on extensive quantitative and qualitative sources. 163pp.

Carmen Bernard, "Negros esclavos y libres en las ciudades americanas." The author presents a balanced study of the various black subcultures—free, slave, and racially mixed—that thrived in Latin American cities, and their relations with the dominant power structures at the beginning of the 19th Century. Bernard is at her best in presenting both negative and positive elements of the groups she studies, and their interactions among themselves. 155pp.

Jean-Pierre Tardieu, "Relaciones interétnicas en América, siglos XVI-XIX." A critical study of the role of Spanish and Portuguese institutions in the social relations between the principal racial and ethnic groups in America. In particular the author examines the tense relationships between Africans and Amerindians and the segregationist solutions adopted by authorities to diffuse the situation. 261pp.

Carlos Aguirre, coordinator, "La abolición de la esclavitud en Hispanoamérica y Brasil: Nuevos aportes y debates historiográficos." This is the collection of the work of some six scholars, from a variety of social scientific and historical methodologies, focusing not only on the abolition of slavery, but also on the prior diminishment of the slave trade. 115pp.

Joseph C. Miller, "Slavery and Slaving in World History. A Bibliography, 1900-1991." This is probably the most complete bibliography on the subject to date. 1,051pp.

Without doubt, the most thorough review of the literature that Andrés-Gallego realizes in this volume is in the treatment of the expulsion of the Jesuits from Spanish domains in 1767. Some 2,000 Jesuits from Latin America and 2,746 from Spain were uprooted by the edict of Charles III. The reasons for this catastrophic event for the Jesuit order, the Church, Spain, and for Latin America are multifaceted. On the political level, it was part of the larger struggle between the Papacy and the Bourbon program of royal absolutism. The Bourbon monarchy saw the Society of Jesus as the Pope's most efficacious agents in countering this policy because of the order's special bond with the Roman Pontiff, and its wealth and influence on the peninsula and throughout the colonies. In addition, a number of other factors influenced the event including the myth that the Jesuits had set up a state within a state in the Reductions of Paraguay, and the envy that many felt by the influence that Jesuit confessors had at the Spanish court. Also at work was the perception by civil and ecclesiastical authorities, as well as, merchants that the Jesuits were avaricious and insubordinate. Key to this perception was the way that the Society zealously and effectively guarded its economic and religious privileges

from the Crown and the Papacy over and against the jurisdiction and interests of these elites.

Andrés-Gallego makes a number of interesting suggestions to further our understanding of the factors which led to the expulsion and its impact. For example, he argues that scholarship would be better served by focusing on how the myth of the Jesuit state within a state and the envy that many elites had toward the Society of Jesus shaped the anti-Jesuit mentality of those who supported the expulsion of the Society, rather than focusing on the objectivity of those charges against the Society. He encourages more comparative studies of the popular political attitudes surrounding the expulsion of the Society from Portugal (1759), Spain (1767), and its universal suppression (1773).

The economics of the expulsion would also profit from further study. It is clear that vast treasures of Jesuit gold and silver from the Reductions were not found, even while the literature has documented large Jesuit farms, sugar plantations, and cattle ranches in central Mexico and Peru worth millions of pesos, with thousands of slaves who labored in them (5,224 slaves in Peru and 1,190 in Chile alone). But how the Jesuits administered what they owned remains in need of study. Were the brothers who administered these farms and ranches as successful as they are reputed? Some recent studies suggest that Jesuit farming concerns in Guatemala and parts of Peru were far from lucrative. What was the economic theory and theology of wealth and work that guided their business enterprises? And was it the case that those who took over from the Jesuits after the expulsion failed to meet the production quotas that the Jesuits achieved during their tenure and why?

Other areas also need further research, including, what happened to less distinguished Jesuits after the expulsion and how they understood these events. In particular, did they hope to return to their former homes. Related to this, is the issue of how many Jesuits died as a result of the expulsion, since the current literature on the subject offers very dissimilar figures. The "hope of return," as Andrés-Gallego calls it, also raises the question of whether the contemporaries of the Jesuits expected their quick vindication. He even suggests this expectation led some owners of former Jesuit property to invest little in its upkeep, out of fear of losing what they invested when the Jesuits returned from their exile. Finally, the question of the impact of the expulsion on Latin American independence offers a host of unanswered questions from what happened to the populist scholasticism of Suarez that the Society propagated and which opposed royal absolutism, to the interpretation that liberal elites, especially liberal 19th Century Latin American governments, gave to the expulsion.

Among the fourteen studies contained in the CD-Rom of the 1767 expulsion, the following deserve attention:

Enrique Villalba Pérez, "Consecuencias educativas de la expulsión de los jesuitas de América." A never-before attempted historiographical study of the histories of Jesuit educational centers in Latin America, and the impact that the expulsion had on them. Interestingly, the author chronicles how in some cases, the expulsion of the Jesuits did not necessarily mean that education in a particular place fared worse than during their tenure. In some cases, the exit of the Jesuits produced salutary innovations. 156pp.

Ramón Gutiérrez, director, "Historia urbana de las reducciones jesuíticas suramericanas: continuidad, rupturas y cambios (siglos XVIII-XX)." A study of the Reductions seen from the innovative perspective of urban history, but informed from classical studies on the subject from theological and missiological perspectives. 384pp.

Agustín Galán García, "Compendio de la población de América y Filipinas (ca. 1778-1780), de Manuel Ignacio de Arenas." This work marks the first time that this manuscript catalog of over three hundred works, about different aspects of the Latin American reality, published by the expelled Jesuits is available. 149pp.

José Andrés-Gallego, "Porqué los jesuitas: razón y sin razón de una decisión capital." This is a more detailed historiographical treatment of the essay provided in this book on the reasons for and the consequences of the expulsion. 219pp.

Fordham University, New York

Claudio M. Burgaleta, S.J.

Die Hl. Katharina von Alexandria auf der Jesuitenbühne. Drei Innsbrucker Dramen aus den Jahren 1576, 1577 und 1606. Von Stefan Tilg. [Frühe Neuzeit 101.] (Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag, 2005. Ss. 474. € 120,00, Hardback.)

Mit dem vorliegenden Werk, einer ausgebauten Dissertation an der Universität Innsbruck, macht Stefan Tilg im Rahmen einer Edition drei Dramen zum Leben der Heiligen Katharina von Alexandrien zugänglich, die in den Jahren 1576, 1577 und 1606 im Jesuitenkolleg Innsbruck zur Aufführung gekommen sind. In der Einleitung (S. 1-46) setzt sich der Autor mit drei Themenkreisen tiefer auseinander: mit der Katharinenlegende und ihrer Wirkungsgeschichte, mit den konkreten Verhältnissen bzw. Anliegen, die die Jesuiten in Innsbruck zur Aufführung von Katharinendramen geführt haben, sowie mit den Vorlagen und Autoren der drei Dramen.

Die Legende der Heiligen Katharina erfuhr seit dem Spätmittelalter zahlreiche literarische Bearbeitungen. Diese „Popularität“ wurde durch den christlichen Humanismus trotz fehlender Historizität der Legende noch verstärkt. Grund dafür war Katharinas umfassende Eloquenz, mittels der sie